



# ENERGY STAR® Smart Thermostat Products

## Method to Demonstrate Field Savings Draft 1 Version 2.0

### 1) OVERVIEW

This method shall be used to demonstrate field savings for ENERGY STAR Smart Thermostat (ST) Products.

### 2) APPLICABILITY

This ENERGY STAR Method is applicable to Smart Thermostat Products as defined in the ENERGY STAR Eligibility Criteria for Smart Thermostat Products.

### 3) DEFINITIONS

Unless otherwise specified, all terms used in this document are consistent with the definitions contained in the ENERGY STAR Eligibility Criteria for Smart Thermostat Products.

### 4) DEMONSTRATING FIELD SAVINGS

Field savings of ST Products shall be assessed for product certification as well as for periodic reporting as detailed in the Partner Commitments section of the ENERGY STAR Program Requirements for Smart Thermostat Products.

1. Install and configure the then current **major release** of the ENERGY STAR ST Field Savings Software using the open-source code and instructions available at:

- a. Documentation: <https://epathermostat.readthedocs.io/en/latest/>
- b. Source code: <https://github.com/EPAENERGYSTAR/epathermostat>

2. From the set of all instances of a fielded ST Product Family in the US, generate a randomly selected data set via the following procedure:

- a. Generate a metadata file that includes all instances of a fielded ST Product in the US, with the following information:
  - i. included data: "thermostat\_id", "heat\_type", "heat\_stage", "cool\_type", "cool\_stage", "zipcode", "utc\_offset", and "interval\_data\_filename";
  - ii. thermostat\_id is a unique alphanumeric string;

**Important Note:** thermostat\_id shall be a pre-existing unique identifier associated with the ST Device (e.g., MAC address or serial number) or directly mapped from it using consistent rules (e.g., to remove non-alphanumeric characters or to eliminate duplicates).

- iii. heat\_type: In each case this refers to heating equipment type controlled by the thermostat, with the understanding that there may be other heating devices in the home.
  - 1.furnace\_or\_boiler: Forced air furnace or boiler (any fuel)
  - 2.heat\_pump\_electric\_backup: Only heating where thermostat controls heat pump with electric resistance heat (strip heat)
  - 3.heat\_pump\_no\_backup: Only heating where thermostat controls heat pump without any backup.
  - 4.heat\_pump\_dual\_fuel: Only heating where thermostat controls dual fuel heat pump (e.g., electric heat pump with a gas or oil-fired backup system)

- 46 5. electric\_resistance: electric furnace or Line Voltage controlled heaters (baseboard,  
 47 radiant etc.)  
 48 6. other: not included in any of the above.  
 49 7. none: Does not control a heating system  
 50 iv. heat\_stage: This refers to how the primary heating equipment is wired at the thermostat,  
 51 understanding that multi-stage or variable speed equipment may not be wired as such.  
 52 1. single\_stage: Single capacity heater or single stage compressor, also called fixed  
 53 capacity or fixed speed.  
 54 2. single\_speed: Synonym for single\_stage.  
 55 3. two\_stage: Dual capacity furnace, dual stage compressor, or dual compressors.  
 56 4. two\_speed: Synonym for “two\_stage”  
 57 5. modulating: Modulating or variable capacity unit, or one with three or more capacity  
 58 stages.  
 59 v. cool\_type: In each case this refers to cooling equipment type controlled by the  
 60 thermostat, with the understanding that there may be other cooling devices in the home.  
 61 1. heat\_pump: Heat pump w/ cooling  
 62 2. central: Central AC  
 63 3. other: Mini-split, evaporative cooler, etc.  
 64 4. none: No central cooling system  
 65 vi. cool\_stage: This refers to how the primary cooling equipment is wired at the thermostat,  
 66 understanding that multi-stage or variable speed equipment may not be wired as such.  
 67 1. single\_stage: Single stage compressor  
 68 2. two\_stage: Dual stage compressor or dual compressors  
 69 3. single\_speed: Synonym for single\_stage.  
 70 4. two\_speed: Synonym for two\_stage.  
 71 5. modulating: Modulating or variable capacity compressor or having three or more capacity  
 72 stages.

**Note:** In Version 2, EPA has implemented the ability to evaluate installations in which thermostats are controlling two stage equipment. The method uses an equivalent full load run time instead of simple run time. The equivalent full load run time is the sum of run time, weighted by the relative capacity of each stage. For instance, 10 run minutes in a stage with 50% of the full capacity would contribute 5 minutes of equivalent full load run time. In cases where the vendor knows the relative capacity of each stage, they may calculate such and include it in the input interval data file. In the more usual circumstance where vendors do not know the relative capacity of the stages, the software automatically assumes that stage 1 is 65% of full capacity for fossil fuel systems and 72% of full capacity for compressor-based systems. While not perfect, this will allow some installations with dual-capacity equipment to be included in the analysis. Those installations for which this represents actual behavior poorly are expected to be filtered out of the statistical calculations.

- 84 In addition, with the inclusion of line voltage thermostats in the scope of the specification,  
 85 EPA has included a heating equipment type appropriate for these products.  
 86 vii. zipcode is the US ZIP code where the thermostat is installed;  
 87 viii. utc\_offset is the offset of the timestamps in the file; and  
 88 ix. interval\_data\_filename: the filename for the file containing the actual data.  
 89 b. from the above metadata file, generate a new metadata file that eliminates STs according to  
 90 the following rules:  
 91 i. thermostat\_id is null or invalid;  
 92 ii. heat\_type, heat stage, cool\_type, or cool\_stage is beyond the scope of ENERGY STAR  
 93 specification which cannot be analyzed by the software, or changes during the reporting  
 94 period;  
 95 iii. zipcode is null, invalid, or changes during the reporting period;

- 96 c. from the above metadata file, split STs into 5 climate zone metadata files, using [this file \(EE](#)  
97 [weather\)](#), which maps U.S. ZIP codes with the following Energy Information Administration  
98 (EIA) climate zones:  
99 i. Cold/Very Cold  
100 ii. Hot Dry/Mixed Dry  
101 iii. Hot Humid  
102 iv. Mixed Humid  
103 v. Marine  
104 d. Sort each climate zone metadata file by the unique thermostat\_id assigned to each  
105 thermostat. (Refer to Appendix A for guidance on sorting method).<sup>1</sup>  
106 e. Use numpy.random.RandomState(number) to set a local (not global) random seed for the  
107 selection of the sample of thermostats in each climate zone, using the seeds provided by  
108 EPA.
- 109 **Important Note:** It is important to use a local seed because if other processes call on the  
110 seed (as might happen with a global seed), the selection will not be  
111 reproducible or auditable. Refer to the numpy documentation  
112 at [https://numpy.org/doc/1.22/reference/random/generated/numpy.random.](https://numpy.org/doc/1.22/reference/random/generated/numpy.random.seed.html)  
113 [seed.html](https://numpy.org/doc/1.22/reference/random/generated/numpy.random.seed.html) for more information and/or refer to the sample  
114 thermostat\_selection.py code for more details on how best to set the seed  
115 for numpy.
- 116 f. For each of the five EIA climate zones, generate metadata files with a random sample of  
117 1000 STs without replacement (i.e., no duplicate entries). If the Partner has fewer than 1000  
118 thermostats in an EIA climate zone from which to sample, include all thermostats for that  
119 climate zone.<sup>1</sup> There must be at least 30 thermostats in each climate zone after automatic  
120 filtering during analysis.
- 121 g. Using the above metadata files, generate files that follow the requisite file format and content  
122 requirements in [https://epathermostat.readthedocs.io/en/feature-](https://epathermostat.readthedocs.io/en/feature-epathermostat_2.0/data_files.html#input-data)  
123 [epathermostat 2.0/data\\_files.html#input-data](https://epathermostat.readthedocs.io/en/feature-epathermostat_2.0/data_files.html#input-data)<sup>1</sup>  
124 i. a single metadata file that includes all STs from the above step; and  
125 ii. a separate interval data file for each included unique thermostat\_id.
- 126 h. To generate an additional dataset for Resistance Heat Utilization, use the same seeds and  
127 sampling routine as above, but from a pool of only Heat type: heat\_pump\_electric\_backup,  
128 heat\_pump\_no\_electric\_backup or heat\_pump\_dual\_fuel.

129 **Note:** EPA reminds partners that our goal is for this Method to be as easy for partners to perform as  
130 possible, consistent with fairness, reproducibility, and auditability. All of the changes noted below were  
131 made with these principles in mind. EPA welcomes additional feedback about furthering these aims.

132 EPA seeks feedback on the metadata file generated for the full population of the product family in step  
133 2).a.i. Its creation supports the auditability of the process, but we'd like to minimize the burden  
134 associated with creating and storing it. The "utc-offset" and "interval\_data\_filename" items are not  
135 needed for this step but will be needed in the metadata files for thermostats in the final sample that is  
136 analyzed. Would partners prefer that they be optional in this step? Note that we discourage partners  
137 from producing the actual interval data files at this step and presume (given the computing burden  
138 involved) that they are typically not generated.

139 Based on the stakeholder feedback in the discussion guide, EPA proposes to increase the maximum  
140 sample size to 1000 thermostats per climate zone. EPA proposes this value after thorough consideration  
141 to ensure that undue advantage isn't offered to large vendors due to narrowing confidence intervals while  
142 improving precision and stability of metric scores. Note that this is a maximum – as before, stakeholders  
143 are not required to include this many samples if they do not have them.

144 EPA also proposes requiring a minimum of 30 thermostats per climate zone to ensure the results reflect  
145 the performance of the thermostat rather than idiosyncrasies of the homes in the sample.

146 The thermostat team is aware that the new output sample size requirement will make it harder for new  
147 entrants to the smart thermostat space to demonstrate field savings and earn the ENERGY STAR. EPA  
148 welcomes stakeholder feedback on this proposal.

149 EPA has learned of the importance of the seeds distributed by EPA being specific to the selection  
150 process (rather than being used as global seeds), because otherwise they will be used by other  
151 processes and updated, making the selection non-reproducible and therefore unable to be audited. The  
152 proposed method change and corresponding changes to the suggested random selection code (see  
153 Appendix A) implement this change.

154 EPA and Natural Resources Canada (NRCan) have discussed including installations in Canada in the  
155 analysis. If they were, the "zipcode" field would include postal codes for Canadian locations that would  
156 allow outdoor temperature lookup similar to procedures using US zip codes. In this scenario, installations  
157 in the US and in Canada in similar climates could be included in one zone. The possibility exists of  
158 automatically calculating different heating and cooling savings metrics for Canada, with the various  
159 climate zones weighted as appropriate for Canadian energy use. As of yet, this work has not been  
160 funded and therefore has not proceeded.

- 161  
162 3. Verify that this data set:
- 163 a. consists of one metadata file and  $n$  interval data files (one interval data file for each ST in the
  - 164 sample)
  - 165 b. includes ST Products in each of the five EIA climate zones: Very Cold/Cold, Hot Dry/Mixed
  - 166 Dry, Hot Humid, Mixed Humid, and Marine
  - 167 c. adheres to the relevant reporting period criteria as detailed in the Partner Commitments
  - 168 section of the ENERGY STAR Program Requirements for Connected Thermostat Products;
  - 169 and
  - 170 d. includes only ST Products that control HVAC equipment types as noted in 2.a.iii – vi above
  - 171 which can be analyzed by the software and fall within the scope of the specification.
  - 172
- 173 4. Process the data set using the ENERGY STAR ST Field Savings Software. To be valid, these
- 174 quantities must be based on at least 30 thermostats per climate zone after filtering. In addition, at
- 175 least 30% of thermostat files must be retained through the process. The output includes:
- 176 a. Mean cooling and heating savings scores (% run time reduction) with associated standard
  - 177 error of the mean, and decile bins, in each of five EIA climate zones.
  - 178 b. The lower 95% confidence interval of the mean cooling and heating savings scores (% run
  - 179 time reduction) with decile bins in each of the five EIA climate zones.
  - 180 c. Weighted national average cooling and heating savings scores (% run time reduction) with
  - 181 associated standard error of the mean.
  - 182 d. Weighted national average of the lower 95% confidence interval of the mean cooling and
  - 183 heating savings scores (% run time reduction).
  - 184 e. Mean resistance heat utilization for heat pumps with backup electric resistance heating, in
  - 185 5°F outdoor temperature bins from 60°F to 0°F across all climate zones with and without
  - 186 filtering.
  - 187 f. Mean resistance heat utilization for heat pumps with backup electric resistance heating, in a
  - 188 singular bin from 30°F to 45°F across all climate zones with and without filtering.
  - 189
- 190 5. Submit the ST Field Savings Software certification zip file comprising of metric scores for filtered
- 191 data and a summary statistics file to evaluate performance metric and RHU
- 192 a. to the Certification Body for initial product certification, or
  - 193 b. to EPA for ongoing reporting.

194 EPA requests that additional output files such as advanced statistics filtering, metrics output file  
195 and error log file also be submitted to further refine metrics quality but the submission of the same  
196 is not mandatory as per partnership requirements. Vendors may anonymize the additional output  
197 files further as necessary before submitting it.

- 198 6. Retain the following data for a period not less than five years from the associated file submission:

- 199 a. raw input data files for each thermostat\_id in the ST data set used to assess savings.
- 200 b. all metadata files created in step 4.2. and all random seeds with a reference to the metadata
- 201 files for which each seed was used.
- 202 c. ST interval data file, generated in step 4.2.g., and used with the ENERGY STAR ST field
- 203 savings software to assess reported savings; and
- 204 d. All output files generated by the software and submitted to EPA or to certification bodies.

205 **Note:** EPA proposes that at least 30% thermostats are retained after filtering to ensure quality of fit to the  
206 linear model and credibility of metric scores published. Many vendors have more than 50% of their  
207 samples filtered out of the statistics calculation. EPA and our partners have spent considerable time  
208 investigating the same and the Version 2 software includes logging functionality to the importer script.  
209 This documents thermostats that were present in the metadata file but were not imported, which can help  
210 partners troubleshoot why particular thermostats were rejected. The tool also generates a separate log  
211 file with the thermostat ID and the reason why the thermostat was rejected to aid in tracing any issues  
212 with importing the thermostat.

213 In addition, EPA and partners have discussed that a significant number of thermostats are eliminated  
214 from the statistical calculations because parameters of the model of the home's response to heating (or  
215 cooling) run time come out as slightly outside what makes physical sense. Updating how the model is  
216 derived might allow slightly different parameters that makes physical sense and also result in a good  
217 correlation with the data. If so, that thermostat could be used in deriving the statistical results. EPA  
218 continues to be interested in this update but currently is unable to fund the bulk of the work to update the  
219 software. We would welcome more thorough participation by partners in solving this problem and would  
220 be able to incorporate suggested software changes into Version 2 once they are tested.

221 These measures may be continually improved, and others implemented, as the Version 2 software  
222 evolves. EPA looks forward to continuing to work with stakeholders on this issue.

223

224

225

226

227

228

229

230

231

232

233

234

235

236

237

238 **APPENDIX A: CODE FOR SORTING AND REPRODUCIBLE RANDOM SAMPLING OF**  
239 **THERMOSTATS**

240 This section provides guidance for selecting thermostats for the sample. Source code and detailed  
241 documentation are available at the following locations:

242 The code for selecting thermostats for sampling is available on our GitHub repository. The  
243 `thermostat_selection.py` [code](#) is available at the following location under the `scripts` directory.

244 **Note:** Previous versions of this code required the use of Python's `natsort` module. This module is no  
245 longer required for sorting identifiers. Based on the partner feedback, EPA determined that the use of the  
246 module complicated the selection process for vendors with large datasets. Some vendors were adversely  
247 affected by the requirement to use `natsort`. EPA is relaxing this requirement to alleviate any friction for  
248 submissions. If vendors are currently using `natsort` they are free to continue using `natsort` for  
249 sorting identifiers. The aim of this proposal is to remove any unnecessary overhead in the sampling  
250 process. If the sampling process is not adversely affected by downloading data locally and using  
251 `natsort` then vendors are free to continue using it.

252 EPA requires that stakeholders use a reproducible sorting method for their data. Many databases (such  
253 as those using a SQL-based query language) have the ability to order data prior to selection.  
254 Stakeholders should sort their identifiers using whatever methodology is convenient and reproducible.  
255 Sorting methods that are not reproducible or give varying results are not acceptable. In the cases where  
256 database sorting is not predictable or reproducible EPA recommends using another methodology such  
257 as Python's built-in sorting or `natsort`.

258 Certain databases may have issues with repeatable sorting because of techniques like sharding or other  
259 methodologies to store large sets of data. EPA recommends doing several tests to ensure that the  
260 thermostat ids are consistently sorted between runs. If the sorting is inconsistent you may need to contact  
261 your database vendor or other support forums to determine how to achieve a consistent sorted dataset.

262 **Example:**

263 This simple example uses the syntax for a typical SQL database. The sort order is ascending:

264 

```
select ct_identifier from tstats order by ct_identifier asc;
```

265 **Note:** This is a basic example. It does not have any of the other filtering a vendor might need such as  
266 climate zones, time-periods, or other filtering that may be required for selecting data from your thermostat  
267 database.

268 Documenting this process can be as simple as documenting the query that is being used for doing the  
269 selection / sorting. EPA's aim is for stakeholders to be able to replicate the process should there be an  
270 issue with their data or should they be required to resubmit data.

271 **Sample selection code**

272 The sample selection code provided demonstrates the following steps:

- 273 1. Downloading data from a database or files for sampling (based on Climate Zone)  
274 2. Randomly select a few thermostats (currently 1000) per climate zone based on a provided seed.  
275 3. Sort the thermostat IDs to aid in detecting reproducibility issues.  
276 4. Combine the thermostat IDs and output the results.

277 This code needs to be modified for your specific environment and serves as a template for above tasks.

278 [https://github.com/EPAENERGYSTAR/epathermostat/blob/feature/epathermostat\\_2.0/scripts/thermostat](https://github.com/EPAENERGYSTAR/epathermostat/blob/feature/epathermostat_2.0/scripts/thermostat_selection.py)  
279 [selection.py](https://github.com/EPAENERGYSTAR/epathermostat/blob/feature/epathermostat_2.0/scripts/thermostat_selection.py) APPENDIX B: DESCRIPTION OF SAVINGS METHODOLOGY & ALGORITHMS USED IN  
280 THE ENERGY STAR ST FIELD SAVINGS SOFTWARE

281 This description pertains to the V2.0 release. Source code and detailed documentation are available at  
282 the following locations:

283 Documentation: <https://epathermostat.readthedocs.io/en/latest/index.html>

284 Source code: <https://github.com/EPAENERGYSTAR/epathermostat>

## 285 OVERVIEW OF SOFTWARE METHODOLOGY

286 The software consists of two modules (*thermostat* and *statistics*) which assess ST savings expressed as  
287 the run time reduction relative to the baseline and resistance heat utilization (RHU) expressed as a  
288 percentage in a specific temperature bin for heat pump systems only.

- 289 ○ *Thermostat Module* - The thermostat module separately assesses savings due to setback (for  
290 heating and cooling separately) and RHU for each thermostat in the data set, as well as  
291 identifying the data quality for each thermostat.
  - 292 1. *Read in input files* – a metadata file with a record for each ST in the data set and an interval  
293 data file for each ST in the data set with a record for each hour<sup>1</sup>.
  - 294 2. *Check ST interval data* – reject ST data files that are missing too much data, or if  
295 corresponding outdoor temperature data is not available. Indoor and outdoor temperature  
296 data gaps of up to 2 hours are interpolated. After interpolation, any days with gaps are  
297 excluded from the analysis. If more than 5% of days are missing HVAC run time data, the ST  
298 is excluded.
  - 299 3. *Read in outdoor temperature data* - use the ZIP Code included in the metadata file to  
300 determine the closest NOAA weather station that is in the same climate zone as the ST and  
301 read in hourly outdoor temperatures;
  - 302 4. *Determine Baseline Comfort Temperatures* – parse the ST indoor temperature history to  
303 determine the occupants' preferred temperatures for heating and cooling;
  - 304 5. *Develop Thermal/HVAC Model* – construct a model of the relationship between heating and  
305 cooling HVAC run time, outside temperature, and indoor temperature;
  - 306 6. *Assess Baseline Run Times* – use the thermal/HVAC model to assess baseline heating and  
307 cooling run times for the ST, i.e., what run times would have been under 24/7 use of baseline  
308 comfort temperatures;
  - 309 7. *Assess ST Savings* – calculate ST savings; expressed as percent run time reduction relative to  
310 the baseline.
  - 311 8. *Assess Resistance Heat Utilization (RHU)* – calculate the fraction of total heating run time  
312 that includes auxiliary or emergency heating (heat pumps only).
  - 313 9. *Produce the metrics output file* – generate a thermostat metrics file that includes a row for  
314 each ST in the data set<sup>2</sup>.

---

<sup>1</sup> For a detailed list of the file structure and contents refer to:  
[https://epathermostat.readthedocs.io/en/latest/data\\_files.html](https://epathermostat.readthedocs.io/en/latest/data_files.html)

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid*

315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323

**Note:** Version 1 of the software did not implement checks for missing data. In Version 2 EPA has implemented missing data checks based on a series of discussions in stakeholder metrics meetings. The data checking includes two criteria: 1) Any data set including valid data (i.e., with run time data gaps of not > 1 hour) for 95% of days in the reporting period is considered complete. 2) For data sets with valid data from less than 95% of days in the reporting period, if they have at least 50 core days they are considered complete and may be included in the analysis. Note that for this second criterion, a thermostat may be included in a heating sample but not a cooling sample or vice versa. Version 2 alpha releases of the software will include this feature for vendors to test on their data in future. EPA welcomes feedback on this proposed method to test for missing data.

324

325  
326

- *Statistics Module* - The statistics module assesses aggregate national and regional savings using the metrics file output from the thermostat module and produces two output files as follows:

327  
328

1. Read in the thermostat modules metrics output file.
2. Produce the statistics file.

329  
330

- The statistics file contains summary statistics for each output variable in the metrics file, including 23 quantile bins, means, and standard errors of the mean.

331

3. Produce the certification file.

332  
333  
334

- *Regional ST savings* – average regional HVAC savings in the five EIA<sup>3</sup> climate zones, along with the weighted average decile bins, weighted average standard error of the mean, and the lower 95% confidence limit of the weighted average.

335  
336  
337  
338

- *National ST savings* – national heating and cooling savings as a weighted average of regional savings, along with associated statistics. Regional savings are weighted by the proportion of national heating or cooling energy consumed in each of the five EIA climate zones.

339  
340

- *Resistance heating utilization (RHU)* – average regional and national RHU and associated statistics (ST's with heat pumps only).

341 **THERMOSTAT MODULE IMPLEMENTATION DETAIL**

342

Assess Heating Savings

343

1. Add hourly outdoor temperature (*T<sub>out</sub>*):

344  
345  
346

- Using the ZIP Code included in the metadata file, determine the closest NOAA weather station that is in the same climate zone as the ST and add the outdoor temperature for each hour (*T<sub>out,d,h</sub>* (°F))

347

2. Calculate core heating days

348  
349  
350  
351

- Core heating days are days where the total heating runtime is greater or equal to 30 minutes and there is no cooling runtime. Only primary heating source runtimes are assessed to determine core heating days. That is, auxiliary and emergency electric resistance heat run times associated with heat pumps are not included.

352

3. Develop the ST/home's unique thermal/HVAC heating run time model

353

- Calculate the Baseline Heating Setpoint (*T<sub>baseheat</sub>*) – the occupant's preferred comfort

---

<sup>3</sup> [https://www.eia.gov/consumption/residential/reports/images/climatezone\\_eere-lq.jpg](https://www.eia.gov/consumption/residential/reports/images/climatezone_eere-lq.jpg)



354 temperatures for heating<sup>4</sup>:

355  $T_{baseheat}$  ( $^{\circ}F$ ) = 90th percentile of indoor temperature on *core heating days*

356 ○ Calculate the average hourly indoor minus outdoor temperature difference ( $\Delta T_{d,h}$ ) for  
357 each core heating day:

358 
$$\Delta T_{d,h} (^{\circ}F) = T_{in_{d,h}} - T_{out_{d,h}}$$

359 where

360  $T_{in_{d,h}}$  is the indoor temperature for core heating day  $d$  and hour  $h$

361  $T_{out_{d,h}}$  is the outdoor temperature for core heating day  $d$  and hour  $h$

362 (from the closest NOAA weather station)

363 ○ Starting with an assumed value of zero for Tau ( $\tau_H = 0$ ), calculate the daily Heating  
364 Thermal Demand ( $HTD_d$ ):

365 
$$HTD_d (^{\circ}F) = \frac{\sum_{h=1}^{24} \max[\Delta T_{d,h} - \tau_H, 0]}{24}$$

366 where

367  $\tau_H$  is the  $\Delta T$  associated with  $HTD = 0$  (zero heating run time), reflecting that,  
368 homes with no heat running tend to be warmer than their surroundings.

369 ○ For the set of all core heating days in the ST interval data file, use ratio estimation to  
370 calculate the home's responsiveness to heating ( $\alpha_H$ ), which will be expected to be  
371 positive for well-behaved thermostats.

372

373 
$$\alpha_H \left( \frac{\text{minutes}}{^{\circ}F} \right) = \frac{\sum_{d=1}^x HRT_d}{\sum_{d=1}^x HTD_d}$$

374 where

375  $HRT_d$  is the actual heating runtime for core heating day  $d$

376 ○ For the set of all core heating days in the ST interval data file, optimize  $\tau_H$  so that it  
377 results in the minimization of the sum of squares of the difference between daily run  
378 times reported by the ST, and calculated daily heating run times.:

379

380 
$$\sum_{d=1}^x (HRT_{actual_d} - HRT_{daily_d})^2$$
 is minimized<sup>5</sup>

381 where

382  $HRT_{daily_d} = \alpha_H * HTD_d$

383  $HRT_{actual_d}$  is the total daily heating run time reported by the ST for  
384 core heating day  $d$ .

385

386 Next recalculate  $\alpha_H$  (using the above step) and record the model's parameters  
387 ( $\tau_H, \alpha_H$ ). Note that  $\alpha_H$  characterizes the response of the home to heating and  $\tau_H$  is the  
388 difference between inside and outside temperatures when heating run time = 0

---

<sup>4</sup> Based on method described in paragraph 3.1.2 of "[A DATA-DRIVEN FRAMEWORK FOR COMPARING RESIDENTIAL THERMOSTAT ENERGY PERFORMANCE](#)," Bryan Urban and Kurt Roth, Fraunhofer USA, July 2014.

<sup>5</sup> The thermostat module calls [Scipy Function leastsq](#)

389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394

**Note:** EPA and ST stakeholders have been working together to update the method of deriving the model, to constrain tau such that fewer thermostats are eliminated from the analysis due to having a non-physical tau. Instead, the analysis will constrain the optimization such that tau is guaranteed to be physically meaningful, and any thermostat with an acceptable fit under this constraint will be included in statistical calculations. The thermostat team and our stakeholders continue to work on this and will update this section as appropriate once changes have been finalized.

395  
396  
397  
398  
399

4. Calculate the cumulative baseline run time for the collection of all core heating days in the ST interval data file (i.e., what would have occurred over the set of all core heating days in the reporting period, had the home been held constant at the preferred heating comfort temperature).

400  
401  
402

- Calculate the difference between the occupant's preferred comfort temperature for heating and the average outside temperature for each hour of each core heating day ( $\Delta T_{baseheat_{d,h}}$ ):

403  
404

$$\Delta T_{baseheat_{d,h}} (\text{°F}) = T_{baseheat} - T_{out_{d,h}}$$

405  
406

- Calculate baseline daily Heating Thermal Demand ( $HTD_{base_d}$ ) for each core heating day:

407  
408

$$HTD_{base_d} = \frac{\sum_{h=1}^{24} \max[\Delta T_{baseheat_{d,h}} - \tau_{H,0}]}{24}$$

409  
410

- Calculate baseline run time as the sum of daily baseline run times for the set of core heating days:

411

412

$$RT_{baseheat} (\text{minutes}) = \sum_{d=1}^x \alpha_H * HTD_{base_d}$$

413

where

414

$\alpha_H$ , determined above, is a constant that is part of ST/home's thermal/HVAC heating run time model

415

416

$HTD_{base_d}$  is the baseline daily Heating Thermal Demand

417

5. Calculate the ST heating savings ( $HS$ ), the percent heating run time reduction, for the reporting period in the ST input file:

418

419

420

$$HS (\%) = \frac{100 * (RT_{baseheat} - RT_{actualheat})}{RT_{baseheat}}$$

421

where

422

$RT_{baseheat}$  is the sum of modeled baseline heating run times for all core heating, and

423

$RT_{actualheat}$  is the sum of heating run times for all core heating days.

424

425

426

#### Assess Cooling Savings

427

1. Add hourly outdoor temperature ( $T_{out}$ ):

428

429

430

- Using the ZIP Code included in the metadata file, determine the closest NOAA weather station that is in the same climate zone as the ST and add the outdoor temperature for each hour ( $T_{out_{d,h}}$  (°F))

431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466

2. Calculate core cooling days
  - Core cooling days are days where the total cooling runtime is greater or equal to 30 minutes and there is no heating runtime. Only primary cooling source runtimes are assessed to determine core cooling days.
3. Develop the ST/home's unique thermal/HVAC heating run time model
  - Calculate the Baseline Cooling Setpoint ( $T_{basecool}$ ) – the occupant's preferred comfort temperatures for cooling<sup>6</sup>:
$$T_{basecool} (^{\circ}F) = 90\text{th percentile of indoor temperature on core cooling days}$$
  - Calculate the average hourly indoor minus outdoor temperature difference ( $\Delta T_{d,h}$ ) for each core cooling day:
$$\Delta T_{d,h} (^{\circ}F) = T_{in_{d,h}} - T_{out_{d,h}}$$
where
    - $T_{in_{d,h}}$  is the indoor temperature for core cooling day  $d$  and hour  $h$
    - $T_{out_{d,h}}$  is the outdoor temperature for core cooling day  $d$  and hour  $h$  (from the closest NOAA weather station)
  - Starting with an assumed value of zero for Tau ( $\tau_c = 0$ ), calculate the daily Cooling Thermal Demand ( $CTD_d$ ):
$$CTD_d (^{\circ}F) = \frac{\sum_{h=1}^{24} \max[\tau_c - \Delta T_{d,h}, 0]}{24}$$
where
    - $\tau_c$  is the  $\Delta T$  associated with  $CTD = 0$  (zero cooling run time), reflecting that homes with no cooling running tend to be warmer than their surroundings.
  - For the set of all core cooling days in the ST interval data file, use ratio estimation to calculate the homes responsiveness to cooling ( $\alpha_c$ ), which will be expected to be positive for well-behaved thermostats.
$$\alpha_c \left( \frac{\text{minutes}}{^{\circ}F} \right) = \frac{\sum_{d=1}^x CRT_d}{\sum_{d=1}^x CTD_d}$$
where
    - $CRT_d$  is the actual cooling runtime for core cooling day  $d$
  - For the set of all core cooling days in the ST interval data file, optimize  $\tau_c$  so that it results in the minimization of the sum of squares of the difference between daily run times reported by the ST, and calculated daily cooling run times.:
$$\sum_{d=1}^x (CRT_{actual_d} - CRT_{daily_d})^2 \text{ is minimized}^7$$
where
    - $CRT_{daily_d} = \alpha_c * CTD_d$
    - $CRT_{actual_d}$  is the total daily cooling run time reported by the ST for

<sup>6</sup> Based on method described in paragraph 3.1.2 of [“A DATA-DRIVEN FRAMEWORK FOR COMPARING RESIDENTIAL THERMOSTAT ENERGY PERFORMANCE,” Bryan Urban and Kurt Roth, Fraunhofer USA, July 2014.](#)

<sup>7</sup> The thermostat module calls [Scipy Function leastsq](#)

467 core cooling day  $d$ .  
 468 Next, recalculate  $\alpha_c$  (using the above step) and record the model's parameters  
 469 ( $\tau_c, \alpha_c$ ). Note that  $\alpha_c$  characterizes the response of the home to cooling and  $\tau_c$  is the  
 470 difference between inside and outside temperatures when cooling run time = 0

471 **Note:** In cooling as well as in heating, the method of deriving the model is in the midst of improvement.  
 472 Software doesn't check for negative alpha, but we expect the software to filter out thermostats with  
 473 negative alpha.

474  
 475 4. Calculate the cumulative baseline run time for the collection of all core cooling days in the ST  
 476 interval data file (i.e., what would have occurred over the set of all core cooling days in the  
 477 reporting period, had the home been held constant at the preferred cooling comfort  
 478 temperature).

479 ○ Calculate the difference between the occupant's preferred comfort temperature for  
 480 cooling and the average outside temperature for each hour of each core cooling day  
 481 ( $\Delta T_{basecool_{d,h}}$ ):

$$\Delta T_{basecool_{d,h}} (\text{°F}) = T_{basecool} - T_{out_{d,h}}$$

482  
 483  
 484 ○ Calculate baseline daily Cooling Thermal Demand ( $CTD_{base_d}$ ) for each core cooling day:

$$CTD_{base_d} = \frac{\sum_{h=1}^{24} \max[\tau_c - \Delta T_{basecool_{d,h}}, 0]}{24}$$

485  
 486  
 487  
 488 ○ Calculate baseline run time as the sum of daily baseline run times for the set of core  
 489 cooling days:

$$RT_{basecool} (\text{minutes}) = \sum_{d=1}^x \alpha_c * CTD_{base_d}$$

492 where  
 493  $\alpha_c$ , determined above, is a constant that is part of ST/home's thermal/HVAC  
 494 cooling run time model  
 495  $CTD_{base_d}$  is the baseline daily Cooling Thermal Demand

496 5. Calculate the ST cooling savings ( $CS$ ), the percent cooling run time reduction, for the  
 497 reporting period in the ST input file:

$$CS (\%) = \frac{100 * (RT_{basecool} - RT_{actualcool})}{RT_{basecool}}$$

498  
 499 where  
 500  $RT_{basecool}$  is the sum of modeled baseline cooling run times for all core cooling and  
 501  $RT_{actualcool}$  is the sum of cooling run times for all core cooling days.  
 502

503  
 504 Calculate Resistance Heating Utilization (RHU)

505 • For heat pump systems only, calculate RHU in 12 (daily average) outdoor temperature bins  
 506 ( $0 \leq T < 5^\circ\text{F}$ ,  $5 \leq T < 10^\circ\text{F}$ , ...,  $55 \leq T \leq 60^\circ\text{F}$ ). For example,  $RHU_{0-5F}$  is calculated as follows:

507

508

$$RHU_{0-5F} (\%) = \frac{(t_{emerg_{0-5F}} + t_{aux_{0-5F}})}{(t_{emerg_{0-5F}} + t_{comp_{0-5F}})}$$

509

where,

510

$t_{emerg_{0-5F}}$  is the total emergency resistance heating run time in the interval data file that occurs on core heating days where  $0^{\circ}F \leq$  average daily outdoor temperature  $< 5^{\circ}F$ .  $t_{emerg}$  is in lieu of compressor operation, e.g., use of electric resistance strip heat under fault conditions or when the outside temperature is very low,

511

512

513

514

$t_{aux_{0-5F}}$  is the total annual auxiliary resistance heating run time in the interval data file that occurs on core heating days where  $0^{\circ}F \leq$  average daily outdoor temperature  $< 5^{\circ}F$ .  $t_{aux}$  is supplemental to compressor operation, e.g., use of electric resistance strip heat to increase heating capacity, and

515

516

517

518

$t_{comp_{0-5F}}$  is the total compressor heating run time in the interval data file that occurs on core heating days where  $0^{\circ}F \leq$  average daily outdoor temperature  $< 5^{\circ}F$ . A proportion of  $t_{comp}$  may occur when auxiliary resistance heating also occurs.

519

520

521

**Note:** In 2017 – 2019 EPA and stakeholders carefully considered the appropriate metric to identify thermostats that avoided saving heat pump run time through excessive use of backup resistance heat. The interval from 30 to 45 F was identified as the outdoor temperature with the most distinction between use of backup heat. In this interval, most heat pumps can deliver significant heating with careful management. Thus, the metric on which we propose a requirement concentrates on this bin. In addition, the calculation of RHU was made more robust by eliminating installations that appeared to have compressors that weren't working properly (indicated by statistics section that filters out the top 5% installations) and those for which 30 – 45F appeared to be far from the system's design temperature (indicated by minimum runtime of 30 hours for the bin).

522

523

524

525

526

527

528

529

530

531

### STATISTICS MODULE IMPLEMENTATION DETAIL

532

After the thermostat module generates an output file for the sample set, the statistics module summarizes these files to assess average savings, expressed as percent run time reduction.

533

534

- Assess average heating savings, cooling savings, and RHU for each of the five EIA climate zones. For example, the average heating savings in climate zone  $cz$  ( $HS_{cz}$ ) is calculated as:

535

536

$$HS_{cz} (\%) = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n HS_{cz,i}}{n}$$

537

where

538

$n$  is the number of STs in the climate region  $cz$

539

$HS_{cz,i}$  is the heating savings for ST  $i$  in climate zone  $cz$ .

540

- Nationally – from regional savings, national savings are calculated as weighted averages for heating and cooling. (see below for details on Climate Zone weightings). Statistics associated with nationally weighted savings estimates include the mean, standard error of the mean, decile bins (q10-q90) and the Lower Bound of the 95<sup>th</sup> Percentile Confidence Interval (LB95). The Nationally Weighted LB95 is calculated via the following formula:

541

542

543

544

545

546

$$SE_{National} = \sqrt{\sum_{CZ=1}^5 (W_{CZ} * SE_{CZ})^2}$$

547

where

548

$SE_{CZ}$  are the standard errors in each climate zone, calculated as the standard deviation

549 in the climate zone divided by the square root of the number of STs analyzed in that  
550 climate zone

551  $W_{CZ}$  are the climate zone weightings

552  $SE_{National}$  is the standard error of the weighted mean  
553

554 The Nationally Weighted LB95 ( $LB95_{National}$ ) is calculated from  $SE_{National}$  as follows:  
555

556

$$LB95_{National} = Mean_{National} - 1.96 * SE_{National}$$

557 Key performance metrics, Nationally Weighted LB95 and 20<sup>th</sup> decile bin q20 are specifically  
558 labelled and placed in the output file for ease of reference.

559 ○ Weighting for heating and cooling is by the proportion of national heating or cooling energy used  
560 in each of the five EIA climate zones, as follows:

Heating	
<i>Climate Region</i>	<i>%BTU vs National</i>
Very Cold/Cold	54.9%
Mixed-Humid	31.2%
Mixed-Dry/Hot-Dry	5.4%
Hot-Humid	4.9%
Marine	3.6%

561

Cooling	
<i>Climate Region</i>	<i>%BTU vs National</i>
Very Cold/Cold	9.6%
Mixed-Humid	34.0%
Mixed-Dry/Hot-Dry	14.4%
Hot-Humid	42.0%
Marine	Not included

562

563 ○ All other National outputs, including National RHU, are calculated as an unweighted average over  
564 all CTs in the sample set.